ERROR ANALYSIS ON GRAMMATICAL ASPECTS OF STUDENT'S NARRATIVE WRITING (A CASE STUDY AT ECONOMICS AND BUSINESS OF MALIKUSSALEH UNIVERSITY IN ACADEMIC YEAR 2014/2015)

Henny Irawati¹

Abstract

The objective of this research is to find out the most typical words which are made by the students in writing. Based on the objective of the research, the writer uses a narrative method. In collecting the data, the writer administers a kind of writing test to students. The research is conducted to first semester of Economics and business faculty of Malikussaleh University. The writer took the correspondent on in 40 students by random sampling. The material is tested based on the English syllabus. Then, the writer analyzes the writing errors done by students. The results of research show that errors on word choice are the most typical errors made by students with 37 or 19.2% and then word order with 32 or 16.6%, followed by verb tenses with 29 or 15.0%. From the results of the research, the writer can conclude that the most typical errors on student’s narrative writing skill at first semester of Economics and Business is errors on word choice. It indicated that the most students need more treatment and remedial teaching from the lecturer towards their errors on English writing right away and it implies that the students still need more practice in order to develop their writing skill.

Key Words: Error Analysis, Narrative Writing

¹Henny Irawati, English Lecturer of Economics and Business Faculty, Malikussaleh University
A. Background of the Study

In English teaching curriculum has emphasized on the mastery of communicative competence through the mastery of a discourse to orally understand and create texts in written form. This is believed as part of four language skills: listening, speaking, reading, and writing.

Concerning about developing those skills, the curriculum requires students to master the four language skills because these skills are related each other. According to Harris: “We may therefore say that language includes four skills, or complexes of skills: listening, speaking, reading, and writing. It is perhaps in this order that we originally learned our native language, and it is in that foreign languages are now very frequently taught.” (Harris, 1969, P.9)

Of the four skills above, writing is considered as the most difficult one. This is because writing involves the complex system of language. As stated by Burnaby in Nunan's book: "Writing is an extremely complex cognitive activity in which the writer is required to demonstrate control of a number of variables simultaneously. At the sentence level these include control of content, format, sentence structure, vocabulary, punctuation, spelling and letter formation" (Nunan, 1989, p. 39)

Several factors that make students think that writing is a difficult skill because of the difference in spelling, pronunciation, the grammatical system and the use of vocabulary between English and Indonesia. In fact, the most difficult problem that is always faced by in Senior High School students is about how to express their ideas meaningfully activity especially in narrative writing. They often make errors when they are asked by the teacher to make writing, such as a paragraph, short story, or answer the question from text in English. These errors could affect the content and quality of their writing. As a result, the reader may be confused or could not understand their writing, consequently; the message could not be conveyed well to reader.

In one occasion, the writer did a survey in Economics students of first semester. Through the informal interview with the English teacher there, English lesson is taught at the second year students twice a week every Monday and Wednesday for two hours. The teaching writing is taught separately from teaching speaking, listening and reading. Not only that, the writer has gotten some information from the English teacher that the students’ ability in writing English especially in constructing sentences is not really satisfying. From the information as well the writer has known that most students are still confused of the use of grammar in making a sentence.

B. The Understanding of Writing

Writing is one of the activities of using language and people use language as a means of communication to say and express ideas for a certain target to reach. Robert Lado points out: “Writing is partial representation of units of language expression. Learning to write a foreign language is learning to put down at a speed greater than that of drawing the conventional symbols of the writing system that represent the utterances one has in mind.”
To study writing is a way to think and feel something by using words then it can form a sentence to convey the messages to others; therefore, the readers can understand our ideas. James M. Mc Crimmon states “Writing is also opportunity to convey something about yourself, to communicate ideas to people beyond your immediate vicinity, to learn something you did not know”.

Moreover, writing is also one of the ways that people convey their ideas on the paper. Furthermore, Penny Ur stresses the purposes of writing, they are; as expression of ideas, the conveying of a message to the reader, so the ideas themselves should arguably be seen as the most important aspect to writing.

In other words, writing is an activity which is done by people to communicate or convey the message to another person but it is indirect way to express ideas through a piece of paper. In addition, writing activity does not only involve more than just producing sentences or putting one word after another, but writing is also a thinking process, the way to communicate.

Halliday points out, “Writing has evolved in societies as a result of cultural changes creating communicative needs which cannot be readily met by the spoken language”. In addition, J.B.Heaton adds that the writing skill are complex and difficult to teach, requiring mastery not only of grammatical and rhetorical devices but also of conceptual and judgment elements”.

From the definitions of writing above, it can be understood why writing is difficult activity for most people. Moreover, writing activity does not only involve more than just producing sentences or putting one word after another, but writing is also a thinking process, the way to communicate indirectly with another people through a piece of the paper.

C. The Kinds of Writing

Writing skill is different from other language skills. In writing skill, students must keep in mind their purpose, imagine about the ideas which are relevant to that purpose. Besides, they have to think about how to make sentence and organize those facts in coherent way. As we know, writing does not just involve learning to use word by word, but also primarily how to select and organize experience according to certain purpose.

The kinds and purposes of writing are different. They can be in the form of letter, short sentence, stories, novels, and editorials, etc. The various kinds of writing as Thomas Cooley states are:

a. Exposition is writing to inform.

b. Persuasion and Description is writing to convince.

c. Narration and Description are writing to create.

d. Journal, Autobiographies, and personal essay are writing to express the self.

It is added by George E. Wishon that the kinds of writing could be divided as: narration, description, exposition, and argumentation. The narration tells a story; the descriptive is a verbal picture of a person, place, or things; the expository explains how to do something or informs the readers about something, and the argumentative is designed to convince or
persuade someone that something is true or should be done.

In detail the writer is going give an example of each kind of writing:

a. Narration

Narration is the form of writing used to relate the story of acts or events narration places occurrences in time and tells what happened according to natural time sequence. Types of narration include short stories, novels, and new stories, as well as a large part of our everyday social interchange in the form of letters and conversation.

Example:

The once was a Prince who wanted to marry a princess, but she had to be a real princess. So he went to all over the world looking for a real princess. Everywhere he met young ladies who told him there were real princess, but they could never be completely sure that it was true. There was always something about them that not seem quite right. And so, after long time, the prince went back home to his parents and was very sad.

One evening there was terrible storm. It rained heavily and there was thunder and lightning in the sky above the royal castle. Then there was a knock at the castle gate. The old king went out to see who it could be.

A princess was standing outside the gate. The rain down over her hair and clothes and into her shoes. She told the king that she was a real princess, and he asked her to come inside. "Well," said the old queen. "We'll soon find out if that is true." She went into the guest bedroom and took the mattress blanket off the bed. Then she put a little green pea on the bed. She put twenty mattresses on the top of the pea, and the twenty mattresses on the top of the mattress. This was where the princess was going to spend the night.

The next morning the queen asked the princess how she had slept. "Oh, it was terrible!" answered the princess. "I didn't close my eyes all night. I didn't know what was in my bed, but I lay on something hard, and now I am black blue all over. It was quite a terrible night."

Now, the king, the queen and the prince could be sure that she was a real princess. She had felt the little pea through twenty mattresses and twenty blankets. Only a real princess will be able to do that.

b. Description

Description reproduces the way things look, smell, taste, feel, or sound, it may also evolve moods, such as happiness, loneliness, or fear. It is used to create a visual image of people, places, even of units of time-days, time of day, or seasons. It may be used to describe more than outward appearance of people. It may tell about their traits character or personality. So, the purpose of written description is the reader can see what the writer see, hear what the writer hear, smell what the writer smells.

Example:
c. Exposition

Exposition is used for giving information, making explanation, and interpreting meaning. It includes editorials, essays, informative, and instructional material. Exposition may be used to explain a process, that is, to tell how something made or done. Moreover, an explanation of what a word or term means is another exposition too.

Example:

Sedimentary rock is formed by the compression of layers of particles into a solid form. Sediments such as sand and mud settle onto the floors of oceans and lakes. Over a long period of time, several layers of sediments collect on the floor. These layers are pressed together for many thousands of years, fusing the small solid particles of mud and sand to form solid rock. This type of rock is called sedimentary rock.

d. Argumentation

Argumentation is used in persuading and convincing. It is closely related to exposition and is often found a combined with it.

Example:

Moon-tracking is a news science-sport. Great scientists are already in the game, and thousands of amateurs are entering it. When the first manufactured moon was launched, the game got under way in earnest. The radio amateurs photographers, and observers in large numbers began to record the orbiting of artificial satellites.

The new sport is more that a sport. It is a serious scientific venture that observes more than casual interest. It offers opportunities to increase human knowledge. We may learn, for the first time, the true shape of the earth, explore mysteries of weather, and find out just how the sun affects of life. Whatever is learned will be shared with the world. Thus, adventure open doors of cooperation between East and West. To a world looking for lasting peace, cooperation in science offers more hope than competition in weapons.
From the four kinds of writing above, the writer chose only a narrative writing to be analyzed. It is because the students of first semester of Economics and Business Faculty have been taught narrative writing by their teacher; so the writer is interested in analyzing student's narrative writing to find out their error. It is useful for teacher to make remedial in teaching English in the future.

According to Jerome Martin, there are some ways that we have to keep in mind when we write a narrative writing:

1) The beginning of a narrative usually introduces the main character and tells where the action takes place. The beginning should be short and, most important; it should get the reader wants to go on reading.

2) The middle of a narrative tells what happened. The writer selects carefully only those details that will help the reader follow what is going on. Most often, the events are arranged in chronological order (time order). In many stories, there is a high point of excitement or interest. This is called the climax of the story.

3) The end of a narrative may be quite short. It winds up the action in a way that gives the reader the feeling that the story has been completed.

Whenever someone want to write a narrative, use chronological order so that the story will be easy to follow; give details about what people did and said; and follow narrative structure by organizing the material into a beginning, middle, and an end.

2. The Purposes of Writing

Writing is an activity that is often done by someone beside speaking activity because this activity is very important for everybody to convey their messages. In this world, there is one who can speak and write and there is one who can not speak but he can write. The most important, he can convey his message, idea and his mind, besides he can develop his or her ability in writing. It is the purpose of writing.

According to Coroline Coffin, et. all. "There are four purposes of writing that should be known by teachers when they ask students to write, namely:

a. As assessment, as an aid to critical thinking, understanding and memory.

b. To extend students’ learning beyond lectures and other formal meetings.

c. To improve students’ communication skills, and

d. To train students as future professionals in particular discipline.

2. The Teaching of English Writing at Economics and Business Faculty

The teaching of writing at Economics and Business Faculty students is done in integrated way. In every session, the topics and activities are vary. The teacher teaches writing sometimes at the same time with grammar. The students apply their grammar knowledge in the form of writing and they write it after they speak, listen, and read. The teaching of writing at Economics and Business Faculty students sometimes use media specifically such as; newspaper, pictures or even things in their surrounding
like their school, house, and etc. Media is used only when it is necessary.

English lesson is taught at the second year students twice a week, every Monday and Wednesday for two hours. The teaching writing is taught separately from teaching speaking, listening and reading, there is special time for writing, sometimes writing is taught to the students at the same time with teaching grammar because according to English teacher in Economics and Business Faculty teaching writing is taught to students based on guide book which has been given by school to them.

The teaching of writing at Economics and Business Faculty is based on the curriculum, it is used as guide to teach English writing, the students are expected to have ability in expressing and pouring their ideas into a descriptive or narrative text. curriculum states:

"Kemampuan menulis adalah kemampuan memahami dan menciptakan berbagai teks fungsional pendek dan menology serta esai berbentuk procedure, recount, descriptive, narrative, report, news item, analytical exposition, hortatory exposition, spoof, explanation, discussion, review, public speaking."

For writing this paper, the writer will ask the students to write a narrative writing as the instrument to get the data.

D. Error

1. The Understanding of Error

There is no doubt, a number of students make various errors in their papers through sheer carelessness or stupidity. Dulay emphasizes:

“Errors are the flawed side of learner speech or writing. People cannot learn language without first systematically committing errors. There are those parts of conversation or composition that deviate from some selected norm of mature language performance”.

Jacek Fisiak cited from S N Srindhar paper “the notion of ‘error’ is a function of the tradition practice to take a teacher centered viewpoint of learner’s performance and to judge the letters in terms of the norms of the target language”

Heidi Dulay et.all state studying learners’ errors serves two major purposes: (1) it provides data from which inferences about the nature of the language learning process can be made; and (2) it indicates to teachers and curriculum developers which part of the target language students have most difficulty producing correctly and which error types detract most from a learner’s ability to communicate effectively.

On the other hand, errors are systematic, consistent deviances characteristic of the learner’s linguistic system at a given stage of learning. Corder said, "the learner’s errors are evidence of this system and are themselves systematic”

It means that the error is one of the deviations often made by students in writing or speech. It can affect the final result of students’ composition or conversation. Furthermore, Brown says, "Error is a noticeable deviation from the adult grammar
of native speaker, reflecting the inter language competence of the learners”

Based on the theories above, it can be explained that error is a natural and noticeable deviation that makes the learner’s language flaw either speech or writing. Student’s error would reflect the lack of the language knowledge or the learner weakness in understanding the structural pattern.

2. The Difference between Mistake and Error

The mistakes or errors that students make in the process of learning a second or foreign language have always been a cause of much concern to the teachers.

Some researchers distinguish between errors caused by factors such as fatigue and intention (what Chomky, called “performance” factor), and errors resulting from lack of knowledge of the rules of the language (what Chomky, called “competence”). In some of the second language literatures, performance errors have been called “mistakes” while the term “errors” was reserved for the systematic deviation due to the learner’s still developing knowledge of the L2 rule system”

H. Douglas Brown mentions that: a mistake refers to a performance, error either a random queues or a slip in that is a failure to utilize a known system correctly. An error is a noticeable deviation from the adult grammar of a native speaker, reflects to the competence of the learner” While mistakes can be self-corrected if the deviation is pointed out to the speaker, errors cannot be self-corrected.

According to Tarigan and Tarigan, he distinguish the meaning of mistakes and errors. A mistake refers to the performance and error refers to competence.

“Kekeliruan (mistake) pada umumnya disebabkan factor performansi.keterbatasan dalam mengingat sesuatu atau kelupaan menyebabkan kekeliruan dalam melafalkan bunyi bahasa, kata, urutan kata, tekanan kata, atau kalimat dan sebagainya. Kekeliruan tidak bersifat lama dan dapat di perbaiki oleh siswa itu sendiri bila yang bersangkutan lebih memusatkan perhatian. Sebaliknya, kesalahan (error) disebabkan oleh faktor kompetensi. Artinya, siswa memang belum memahami system linguistic bahasa yang digunakannya. Kesalahan biasanya terjadi secara konsisten dan sistematis, serta dapat berlangsung lama apabila tidak diperbaiki”

The errors of performance will characteristically be unsystematic and the errors of competence will be systematic. As Miller recommends in Pit. Corder book:

“It would be meaningless to state the rules for making mistakes”, it will be useful therefore to refer to errors of performance as mistakes. Reserving the term error to refer to the systematic errors of the learner from with we are able to reconstruct his knowledge of the language to date,”

Mistakes are insignificance to the process of language learning. However, the problem of determining a learner’s mistake
and a learner’s error is one of some difficulties that involve a range of sophisticated study.

Mistakes are deviations due to performance factors such as memory limitations. For example, mistakes in the sequence of tenses and agreement in long sentences, spelling pronunciations, fatigue, and emotional strain. They are typically random and readily corrected by the learner when his attention drawn to them. On the other hand, errors are systematic, consistent deviances characteristic of the learner’s linguistic system at a given stage of learning”

The clearest and most partial classification of deviance that linguist views; mistakes can only be corrected by their agent if their deviance is pointed out to him or her. Errors cannot be self corrected until further relevant learning to that error implicit or explicit has been provided and converted into intake by the learner. In other word, errors require further relevant learning to take place before they can be self corrected.

3. Types of Error

Error can be classified different types of errors. According to Jack C. Richard, errors can be classified into two types; interlanguage and intralingual errors”

The first type of error is called interlanguage errors, interlanguage errors are caused by the interference of the students native language. These errors are made when the students are trying to transfer their native language system into the English language system which are studying at present. When the students study a foreign language, they have already had their native language habits. Consequently, once they learn a new language and some system, that is the reason they tend to such errors.

The second type of errors, is called intralingual and developmental error. Intralingual and developmental errors obligate the students’ first language ability at a certain stage of study. The cause of this type of error could be found in the structure of the English language itself. This type of error does not have anything to do with the students’ native language.

4. Error Analysis

In learning language, the learners often perform errors everyday in learning. Errors could not be separated from learning foreign language especially in writing. There are two functions of doing error analysis; first is a theoretical function and second is a practical aspect.

Firstly, the theoretical aspect of error analysis is part of methodology of investigating the language learning process. In term of finding out the nature of these psychological process, the writer has to have a means of describing the learner’s knowledge of the target language.

Secondly, the practical aspect of error analysis is the function in guiding the remedial action; the writer must correct an unsatisfactory state of affairs for learner or teacher. In learning English writing, the learners will produce the ungrammatical utterances. This is because English is supposed as a target language to learn. To observe the
errors made by students during their learning process, the writer needs to know the understanding of error analysis given by linguists before doing an error analysis.

Error analysis is a kind of process to observe, analyze and classify the errors made by the students in learning foreign language. Ellis as quoted by Tarigan and Tarigan declares:

“Error analysis is a procedure of work, which is usually used by the researchers and teachers, including collecting samples, identifying errors which are in these samples, explaining those errors, classifying those based on their cause and evaluating or correcting the crucial stage of the errors”

In addition, S.K. Sharman mentions on his paper,

“Error analysis is a process based on analysis of learners’ error with clear objectives involving a suitable effective teaching learning strategy and remedial measures necessary in learning clearly marked in areas of the foreign language “

Sridhar as quoted by Pit Corder in his influential paper suggests a new way of looking at the error made by the learner of a target language.

“He justified the proposed revision in viewpoint on the basis of the substantial similarities between the strategies employed by the infant learning his native language and those of second language learner ”

Based on the theories stated above by the linguists, it can be concluded that error analysis is a theory to study and analyze the students’ error on their writing task. Moreover, error analysis has been used by teachers as a guide to identify and correct the learners. By doing error analysis, the learning and teaching strategies can be evaluated and rearranged toward a better result.

5. The Function and Aims of Error Analysis

In doing error analysis for writing skill, of course, a teacher should know the function of error analysis before doing error analyze. There are four functions of error analysis that is defined by Sridhar in Tarigan's book, namely:

a. To determine the organization of items to be taught in class or textbook from easy to difficult lessons.

b. To determine degrees of emphasis, explanation and exercise of teaching material.

c. To arrange and improve remedial teaching and exercise.

d. To construct learner's proficiency test items.

The aim of error analysis is to find and to know the characteristics of error that is done by students in their writing and make reconstruction in the students writing. The error analysis is not only done for correcting but also reflecting for the learning and teaching strategies to be made.
6. Grammatical Aspects in Doing Error Analysis

In this paper, the writer will classify the students’ narrative writing errors based on grammatical aspect by using Betty Schrampher Azar’s guide book. Moreover, these are the sample of students’ common error and analyzed by using Betty S. Azar theory:

1) Singular-plural
   Incorrect: He have been here for six month.
   Correct: He has been here for six months.

2) Word-Form
   Incorrect: I saw a beauty picture
   Correct: I saw a beautiful picture.

3) Word-Choice
   Incorrect: She got on the taxi
   Correct: She got into the taxi.

4) Verb Tense
   Incorrect: He is here since June
   Correct: He has been here since June.

5) Add a Word
   Incorrect: I want go to the zoo
   Correct: I want to go to the zoo.

6) Omit a word
   Incorrect: She entered to the university
   Correct: She entered the university.

7) Word order
   Incorrect: I saw five times that movie
   Correct: I saw that movie five times.

8) Incomplete Sentence
   Incorrect: I went to bed. Because I was tired.
   Correct: I went to bed because I was tired.

9) Spelling
   Incorrect: An accident occured.
   Correct: An accident occurred.

10. Capitalization
    Incorrect: I am studying english.
    Correct: I am studying English.

11. Punctuation
    Incorrect: What did he say.
    Correct: What did he say?

12. Article
    Incorrect: I had a accident.
    Correct: I had an accident.

13. Meaning Not Clear
    Example: He borrowed some smoke (???)

14. Run-on Sentence
    Incorrect: My roommate was sleeping, we didn’t want to wake her up.
    Correct: My roommate was sleeping. We didn’t want to wake her up.

In this paper, the writer will classify the students’ error by using Betty Azar’s theory. Subsequently, the writer will re-construct the students’ sentence and count the frequency of errors for each category.

7. Procedures of Doing Error Analysis

It is a commonly known, error analysis is kind of process to observe, analyze and classify the errors made by students in learning language. The learners make errors in every composition and could not be separated from learning foreign language and making errors. They will produce the utterances which are ungrammatical, due to English is used as foreign language. To detect the errors made by the students during their learning process, the linguists propose some procedures can be used by the teacher in analyzing the students writing.

The methodology of error analysis consists of:
i. Collection of data (either from a ‘free’ composition by students on given theme or from examination answers);

ii. Identification of errors (labeling, with varying degrees of precision depending on the linguistic sophistication brought to bear on the task, with respect to the exact nature of the deviation).

iii. Classification into error types

iv. Statement of relative frequency of error types;
v. Identification of the areas of difficulty in the target language;

vi. Therapy (remedial drills, lessons, and others).

In addition, Tarigan and Tarigan has an ideal methods:

1. Collecting error samples (mengumpulkan data kesalahan)

2. Identifying and classifying errors (mengidentifikasi dan mengklasifikasi kesalahan).

3. Giving errors state (memperingkat kesalahan)

4. Explaining errors (menjelaskan kesalahan)

5. Interpreting errors places (memperkirakan daerah rawan kesalahan).

6. Correcting errors (mengoreksi kesalahan).

From the theories above, the writer assumes that error analysis is kind of technique process to identify, to classify and to interpret the errors and also to correct the errors made by the students in learning a foreign language.

E. Conclusion

Having been explained and having analyzed in the previous chapters, the writer found the results of the test that was given to the second year students of Economics and Business Faculty of Malikussaleh University. It can be concluded that the students did errors mostly frequent in word choice category with 37 or 19.2%. The students were not successful with word choice. In this case, the student are still confused to choose a right word and put it on a sentence, the students tried to generalize the use of a word in English.

The second of errors which was made by students is word order category with 32 or 16.6%. It means, the students did not understand yet and still confused in using word order and put it in a good sentence.

Moreover, the third error done by the students of Economics and Business Faculty is verb tense with 29 or 15.0%. This errors occur because the students were careless and still confused in using verb tense. It means that most students cannot differentiate form of verb...
tense. In other word, the students make ignorance of rules restriction.

As the result, the writer concludes that the students made the errors because of lack of knowledge. Incomplete application of rules, ignorance of rules restriction (intralingua transfer) and interference of their mother tongue. (interlingua transfer) influenced to English.

However, the error it self should not be neglected by the teacher but it must be noticed and solved by giving a remedial lesson in order to avoid making the same errors in the future.

F. Suggestion
Based on the findings, the writer would like to give some suggestion for remedial lesson, as follow:
1. To reduce error have been done by students especially for:
   a. Word Choice
      The teacher should give more understanding and give a good exposure on the students weakness in teaching English. In this case, the teacher should more focus on practicing in vocabulary building. For example by reading the text and guessing the meaning of text, and the students are able to choose the word which will be used in their sentences by adding more practices and have to many memorize of the word.
   b. Word Order
      The teacher should give a right explanation after giving more practices in making a good and placing word on a sentence.
   c. Verb Tense
      The teacher should always pay attention the students writing in every exercise the make and give note in their writing about verb tense form in making a sentence in the right rule.
2. To avoid the some error in the future, the teacher should give a good and relevant explanation until the students understand it.
3. The teacher have to carry out errors analysis in teaching writing as a guide to remedial lesson.
4. After giving remedial lesson, the teacher find out whether the students make progress or not. It can be done by giving the some test before and after remedial lesson.
REFERENCES


